

The legality of legal texts issued without consulting the Algerian State Council, a comparative study.

مشروعية النصوص القانونية الصادرة دون استشارة مجلس الدولة الجزائري، دراسة مقارنة.

Larbi Benali Boualem*
University of Sidi Bel Abbes
chercheurendroitidara@yahoo.com

Date of send:31/03/2023 Date of acceptance:24/04/2023 Date of publication:30/05/2023

Abstract:

The legality of legal texts that have not been presented to the Council of State as an advisory body is of great importance in law and administrative justice ; With the evolution of the advisory function of the Council of State in comparative legal systems, the fact that legal texts and orders of a legislative nature are subject to consulting the Council of State is compulsory for the executive branch, This has led to the administrative judiciary repealing of legal texts issued by the Government without consulting the Council of State.

The importance of this study is to know the legality of legal texts that have not been submitted to the Algerian Council of State as an advisory body. This is in comparison with the findings of legislation and the judiciary in comparative legal systems, particularly in Egypt and France.

Keywords: Administrative justice- advisory opinion- consultation of the Council of State- The legality of the legal text .

* *Corresponding author*

Introduction

The examiner of the legal texts relating to the advisory role of the Council of State, in particular Organic Law No. 98-01 on the Council of State, as amended by Organic Law No. 18-2,¹ and Executive Decree No. 98-261, laying down the forms and modalities of procedures in the advisory field², It is noted the extent of the Algerian legislator's interest in obliging the executive authority to present its texts of a legislative nature to the advisory body of the Council of State before issuing them, The purpose of this procedure is to ensure that the Council of State as an advisory body controls legislative texts in order to contribute to their enrichment and improved drafting, on the one hand, and on the other hand, to ensure legal consistency and the quality of legal norms.

However, it is noted that the legislator neglected to address the fate of legal texts issued by the government without presenting them to the Council of State, this raises questions about the legality of these texts, especially in the field of their application by the public administration, or in other words: what is the position of the administrative judiciary, especially the State Council as a judicial body, on the legal texts submitted to it in case of dispute and issued without being presented to the advisory body of the State Council?

From the above, the problem of the study becomes clear, which is represented in the following question: What is the legality of legal texts issued without consulting the Council of State in Algeria?

In order to answer the problem raised, we decided to follow the descriptive and analytical approach in order to examine the various legal texts related to the advisory role of the Council of State, so that we can know the position of the Algerian legislator on the legality of legislative texts issued without consulting the Council of State, in violation of the obligation of the executive authority to submit its draft laws to it in application of the legal texts issued in this regard.

We have also adopted a comparative approach to know the position of legislation and the judiciary in both Egypt and France towards legislative texts issued without consulting the Council of State, on the one hand, and on the other hand, to benefit from the experiences of these two countries, especially with regard to the position of the judiciary by approving the invalidity of legal texts that are not submitted to the consultation of the Council of State before their issuance.

For this reason, this study will be divided into two axes: the first includes the legal nature of the consultation of the Council of State in France, Egypt and Algeria, and the second axis deals with the legality of legal texts issued without consulting the Council of State in France, Egypt and Algeria.

Firstly: The Legal nature of the State Council consultation

Knowing the legal nature of the opinions of the State Advisory Council is of great importance, as it reflects the effectiveness of the advisory role in enriching the legal system, Therefore, the degree of effectiveness of the advisory opinion in evaluating legislative texts is measured by the extent of its binding force with the

consulting body, in the sense that the legislator is obligated and obliged, by the text of the law, on the owner of the project submitted to the Council of State to follow the opinion of the latter? Or is it free to choose between the legal draft presented and the one proposed by the Council of State?

Answering the questions raised requires us to study the types of consultation and the extent to which the opinion of the Council of State should be taken into account in comparative systems such as France and Egypt, and then study the legal nature of the consultation of the Algerian Council of State.

1. The Legal nature of the consultation of the French Council of State

The French legislator, like other comparative legislation, has specified in the law on the organization of the French Council of State the compulsory and optional cases in which the executive branch resorts to consulting the Council in a detailed manner that leaves no room for ambiguity³.

1.1. Mandatory consultation

Since the establishment of the French Council of state, it is the largest advisory body, and one of the priorities of its competencies was to provide advice to the government in the field of reviewing and drafting laws and legislation, and remained so even after assuming judicial control and consideration of administrative disputes .

The law of the Council of state of 31 July 1945 stipulates in Article 12 that the draft laws proposed by the government, as well as draft orders and regulations, must be submitted to the Council of state for its opinion⁴.

As the French Constitution of 1946 was promulgated, it contained no reference to the advisory powers of the Council of State, thereby leaving open the legislative power to withdraw legislative competences from the Council. Article 13 of the Constitution stipulates that: "The National Assembly votes solely on the law", but realistically and practically, the function of the Council of State was not contested, but retained all its competencies in accordance with the Law of 1945, but its advisory functions expanded significantly⁵.

With the promulgation of the French Constitution of 1958, the advisory powers of the Council of State have been explicitly stipulated. This Constitution contains four mandatory cases of opinion of the Council of State⁶:

1- Article 39, paragraph 2, of the French Constitution establishes that the opinion of the Council of State on draft laws shall be taken before they are discussed in the Council of Ministers. Article 38 of the Constitution establishes the same for draft orders on which the Council of State must be taken on a mandatory basis. "In order to implement its programme, the Government may request the Parliament to authorize it, through decrees, to take action that normally interferes in the field of law. Such decrees shall be issued in the Council of Ministers after taking the opinion of the Council of State" ;

2- Article 37, paragraph 2, of the Constitution also requires to take the opinion of the Council of State with regard to draft decrees amending legislative acts

adopted prior to the introduction of the new Constitution and dealing with topics of statute under this Constitution;

3- Article 37 of the Constitution also stipulates that the opinion of the Council of State shall be taken as a general rule for all regulatory decrees;

4- The opinion of the Council of State shall also be taken on all extraordinary bills, whether they relate to the amendment of the Constitution, financial laws or laws relating to the ratification of an international treaty or convention.

As a general rule, consulting the Council of State is mandatory when the law decides that the legislative or regulatory text should be submitted to it. and the competence of the Council of State in this regard cannot be limited solely by the situations provided for in the Constitution, In fact, the Council of State's most opinions are issued on the basis of legislative and even regulatory text. Laws often provide that Regulatory Decrees applicable to them are issued after taking the opinion of the Council of State.

It should be noted that the Government cannot take any legislative draft without taking the opinion of the Council of State on it but is not bound by its content.

1.2. Optional consultation

Consultation is optional in two cases: the first is the case where the law provides for the possibility of requesting the opinion of the Council of State, and the second is the absence of a provision requiring such consultation, and it is in the case of ordinary or simple decrees, or any legal matter on which the opinion of ministers can be sought, especially with regard to the difficulties they face in various administrative matters⁷.

The government may request the opinion of the Council of state to interpret or explain constitutional provisions on a particular matter, to interpret a legal text or to express its opinion on a legal problem⁸, and the Council's views resemble its provisions, he identifies the legal issue and answers it with brief reasons.

Furthermore, pursuant to the 2008 French Constitutional Amendment and through article 39 of the last paragraph, the President of one of the two chambers of the legislature may submit to the Council of State the proposal of a law deposited by a member of one of these chambers for an opinion before examining it in the Committee, unless that member objects.

2. The legal nature of the consultation of the Egyptian state council

Under Article 190 of the Egyptian Constitution of 2014, administrative bodies under the executive authority are obliged to submit draft laws and decisions of a legislative nature to the State Council (Legislation Section) before submitting them to the legislative authority for promulgation⁹.

The text of the above-mentioned article was devoid of a penalty for the government in the event that its draft laws were not submitted to the Legislation Department, which led to a jurisprudential dispute about the extent to which this offer is mandatory and about the consequences of non-compliance with it¹⁰; The General

Assembly of the Advisory and Legislative Sections of the Egyptian Council of State was also allowed to express its opinion on the subject.

2.1. the attitude of egyptian jurisprudence

the Jurisprudence on the presentation of bills and regulatory decisions was divided into two teams, The first panel, endorsed by the majority of jurists, considers that the Department is obliged to submit its draft laws and regulations to the Legislation Section prior to their issuance, According to this jurisprudence, the law of the Council of State required the review of the legislation of the Council of State as the competent as one of the sections of the Council as an independent judicial body ". and therefore no entity or even a legislative committee of a ministry, The Council of Ministers or a legal adviser to the President of the Republic has the right to review draft laws; Because they are administrative sections of the entity that formed them, and they have no judicial status that gives them the right to review legislation¹¹.

This tendency is based on the wisdom of the constitutional text, which gives the drafting function to the Section of Legislation. This indicates that the legislature intends to place its projects in the legislative capacity before a highly technical entity, in order to clarify the deficiencies in the draft that it places before the governing body to assume its responsibilities¹².

The second Panel considers that the Administration or the Government is not obliged to submit its draft laws to the Legislative Section, and that the Constitution and the laws in force in Egypt do not require the review of legislation in the State Council, and do not entail any invalidity as a result of the failure to submit legislation to the Council, and that the House of Parliament is the last authority that puts its fingerprints on the draft law, it may amend, add or delete it, and that the review of legislation is the competence of the Legislative Committee of the Council, and this trend concludes that the Government is free to refer draft laws to the Legislation Department of the State Council if it so wishes¹³.

2.2. The position of the General Assembly of the Fatwa and Legislation Sections of the Egyptian State Council

The General Assembly of the fatwa and legislation sections stressed the necessity of submitting draft laws, regulations and decisions of a legislative nature to the legislation section, where it concluded in one of its fatwas that: "..... The legislator, in Article 63 of the State Council Law No. 47 of 1972, required each ministry or department, before issuing any law or decision by the president of the Republic, which has a legislative character or includes abstract general rules or regulations, to submit the proposed draft to the legislation section for consideration for review and drafting..."¹⁴.

3. The legal nature of the consultation of the Algerian Council of State

The legal nature of the request for consultation of the Council of State is intended to answer the following question: Is the government obliged to request the opinion of the Council of State before issuing legislative texts, or is the request for consultation optional?

To answer this question, the two forms of consultation in Algerian legislation should be addressed as follows:

3.1. Mandatory consultation

Article 119, paragraph 3, of the Constitution of 1996¹⁵ states: "The draft laws shall be submitted to the Council of Ministers after taking the opinion of the Council of State and then deposited by the First Minister with the Office of the National People's Assembly."

By reading the phrase "after taking the opinion of the Council of State," taken from the text of article 119, paragraph 3, of the Constitution, it is clear that the opinion of the Council of State has compulsory effects as a formal document and must be adhered to and attached to the file papers, until accepted by the National People's Assembly¹⁶.

The constitutional founder also stressed the obligation to request advice from the State Council in the constitutional amendment of 2016¹⁷, as it made the request for consultation a mandatory procedure through Article 136 on the obligation to request the opinion of the State Council on draft laws, and Article 142 on the obligation to request an opinion on draft orders.

As for the Organic Law No. 98-01 concerning the State Council, especially articles 04 and 12 thereof, we find that the legislator has not clearly made it mandatory to request consultation of the State Council, which adds ambiguity about the mandatory nature of the request for opinion, even with reference to the provisions of Organic Law No. 11-13 on the Council of State¹⁸, as amended and supplemented, we find that its provisions are general and do not prove the mandatory nature of the request for consultation by the Government.

However, the Algerian legislator, in a regulatory legal text that is inferior to the law, came to remove confusion and ambiguity about the mandatory nature of the request for consultation, since under Article 2 of Executive Decree No. 98-261, which defines the forms and modalities of procedures in the advisory field¹⁹, stipulates that: "The Council of State must be notified of draft laws by the Secretary-General of the Government, after the approval of the Council of Government. . .".

3.1. Optional consultation

It appears in the Algerian constitutional system that optional consultation of the Algerian Council of State is non-existent, since the provisions regulating the advisory function of the Council of State contained in articles 142 and 146 of the Constitution and Organic Law 98-01 through articles 04 and 12 thereof do not provide for optional consultation, and the rules of procedure of the Council of State²⁰ do not include a provision for the status of optional consultation, and Executive Decree No. 98-261 specifying the forms and modalities of procedures in the advisory field before the Council of State does not refer to this²¹.

It should also be noted that the Algerian legislator did not distinguish between cases of Mandatory consultation and cases of Optional consultation, contrary to most of the legislation regulating the work of the Council of State, in France, for

example, the government can request the opinion of the Council of State in the absence of a text imposing such consultation, and this is in the case of simple decrees, or any legal issue in which the opinion can be requested by ministers, especially with regard to the difficulties they face regarding various administrative matters²².

Secondly: The legality of legal texts issued without consulting the Council of State

The building of a legislative system to keep pace with developments in various areas, based on firm legislative foundations consistent with constitutional norms and not inconsistent with the State's legal structure, is undoubtedly of the utmost importance and can only be done by enabling the Council of State to exercise its advisory function fully.

the majority of the constitutions of countries adopting the dual judicial system stipulate that the executive authority is obliged to submit its draft legislative texts to the Council of state before issuing them; however, this authority often issues laws without consulting the Council of State, which makes it vulnerable to challenge its legitimacy by stakeholders before the administrative judiciary.that is why we are interested to know the position of the administrative judiciary, especially the Council of State on this issue in France, Egypt and Algeria.

1. The legality of legal texts issued without consulting the French Council of State

All different Governments in France considered that article 21 of the Council of State Act of 1945 obliged the Government to submit draft laws to the Council for review and drafting in terms of compatibility with the Constitution before they were submitted to Parliament; and Article 39 of the 1958 Constitution also upheld this²³.

The legislator also authorized the Council of State to alert on its own initiative of the public authorities to legislative amendments or administrative regulations that are consistent with public interests, as the legislator obligated it to use this license and submit an annual report to the government that includes its suggestions and recommendations in the legislative field²⁴.

The legislative authority in France has confirmed that the Council of State was established to review and draft legal and regulatory texts, and the administrative authority may not override its role in drafting, and if the bills are not submitted to the Council as an advisory body, they may not be considered and broadcast in legislative terms for loss of a fundamental element of the legislative steps²⁵.

The French legislature regarded the Council of State as the technical body specializing in legal review and drafting. and that the submission of draft laws, resolutions and regulations to it for review is a substantial measure, The executive branch must take it before the draft is issued in its binding legal form. and, if the legal text is issued without being submitted to the Council of State for review, it is flawed by legality, It should be challenged by annulment or invalidity, and that this invalidity is not corrected by the legislative authority's approval of it for violating the

Constitution itself and the laws governing it, since the texts are express and clear and no one may violate them²⁶.

Pursuant to the foregoing, there are decrees repealed by the Council of State as a judicial body, for example the Canal Arrête case, where the facts of the case are summarized in the judgement of a military court established by Order No. 62-618 of 17 August 1962 on the establishment of a special military court, which sentenced Mr. Canal to death without the right to appeal, he sued the Council of State for the annulment of Order No. 62-618 concerning the establishment of a military court without the right to appeal against its judgements, which the Council of State deemed to be a serious violation of one of the principles of common law, namely the right of defence²⁷.

2. The legality of legal texts issued without consulting the Egyptian State Council

Egyptian jurisprudence has been divided on the nature of the penalty for the failure to submit legal texts to the Legislative Section of the State Council. The Administrative Court and the Supreme Administrative Court have also been allowed to express their views on this subject.

In terms of jurisprudence, the view was expressed that the failure to present the draft legal text to the section of legislation was a defect in the proceedings of the act issued, whether it was a law or a decision²⁸.

The most common view is that the failure to submit legal texts to the Legislative Section before they are promulgated renders them invalid, but this invalidity is corrected by the adoption of the Act by Parliament, that is, if it is approved by the legislature without reviewing the wording from the section of legislation, it is valid and no one can prejudice it, unless the Supreme Constitutional Court has ruled that this law is unconstitutional²⁹.

As for the failure to submit a draft regulation to the Legislative Section, there is consensus that it is null and void because of a fundamental flaw in the form, namely, the failure to take the opinion of the Council of State on it³⁰.

With regard to the position of the Egyptian Administrative Court, its rulings have long been based on the invalidity of regulations, decrees and executive decisions in the event that they are promulgated before they are submitted to the Legislative Section for review, considering them flawed in form and procedure.

In this regard, a judgement was issued on 18 April 1950, which stated: "... in that this decision is also null and void in form, since it is established that the Council of State has not drafted it and has not reviewed it in accordance with the provisions of articles 11 and 12 of Act No. 112 of 1964 establishing the Council of State"³¹.

With regard to the Supreme Administrative Court's position, in 2017 it issued an important judgement, addressing the issue of the failure to bring laws, legislation and regulations before the Legislative Section of the Conseil d'Etat prior to their approval, and the situation of invalidity and unconstitutionality that it suffered in case of contravention; As a result of article 190 of the present Constitution, the legislature

and government agencies are obliged to send all laws, legislation, regulations and decisions of a legislative nature, and contracts to which the State is a party to the Legislative Section of the State Council for review before they are approved³².

The Supreme Administrative Court stated that the presentation of legislation and regulations to the Legislature Section was compulsory for legal security and non-presentation led to its invalidity. The failure to submit legislation to the Legislative Section resulted in the random legislation and became an impediment to internal stability, an obstacle to social development and economic growth, and an expulsion factor for external investment³³.

3. The legality of the legal texts issued without consulting the Algerian Council of State

If the Algerian legislator has lifted all confusion and ambiguity about the legal nature of the consultation by making it compulsory for the Government to be obliged to consult the Council of State, The legislature omitted to address the legal nature of the legal texts issued without consulting the Council. Referring to the various legal texts that regulated the advisory role of the Council of State, We do not find any text that explicitly or implicitly refers to the question of the legality of legal texts issued without consultation, and what adds to the confusion more about it, is the confidentiality of the Views of the Council of State, since the dissemination of these Views has been overlooked in both legislative and regulatory texts, and even in the rules of procedure of the Council of State, which did not address this subject, although there is no explicit article providing for the confidentiality of the views of the Council of State, they remain unavailable to the public, and the meetings of the Council are confidential and cannot be published, which inevitably prevents us from knowing whether the draft legal text has been submitted to the Council of State for consultation.

Conclusion

From the above, it is clear that the Algerian legislator did not attach any importance to the issue of the legality of legal texts issued without presenting them to the Council of state as an advisory body, he merely obliged the executive branch to submit draft legislative texts to him without being subject to a penalty for their issuance without consulting the Council of State.

The Algerian administrative judiciary has not addressed this issue. This is the opposite of comparative legal and judicial systems, particularly in Egypt and France, where great importance has been given to the advisory role of the State Council by providing for the illegality of legal texts issued without its consultation, this is a belief in the importance of the advisory function of the Council of State in drafting and reviewing legislative texts in accordance with the enrichment of the legal system to make it more applicable and acceptable to society, all of which contribute to the realization of the State of right and law.

Therefore, the Algerian legislator should review the legal texts relating to the advisory function of the Council of State by including legal amendments that

contribute to strengthening the advisory function of the Council of State, to this end, the following recommendations can be made:

1- Adequate attention should be given to the advisory role of the Council of State by extending its request for consultation by the executive branch to cover all legal and regulatory texts on the one hand; On the other hand, it is obliged to submit these texts to the consulting of the Council of State and to arrange for the sanction of invalidity of the texts issued without its consultation;

2- The State Council's views should be taken into account as a constitutional body with an important place in State institutions, especially in view of its high-level competencies, which can enrich the country's legislative system in a manner commensurate with the aspirations of society to achieve transparency in public policies and development;

3- The issue of publishing the views of the Council of State in Algeria has not lived up to what it has achieved in the French or Egyptian system. The Algerian legislature should pay attention to the publication of these opinions in order to make them an excuse for the Government to follow the opinion of the Council of State on the one hand, and on the other hand, the administrative judiciary is allowed access to texts that have not been consulted by the Council of State, so that its position on the question of the legality of legislative texts issued without consulting the Council can be found.

Margins:

1. Organic Law No. 98-01 of May 30, 1998 on the competences, organization and functioning of the Council of State, Algerian Official Gazette No. 37 of June 1, 1998, amended by Organic Law No. 18-02 of March 04, 2018, Official Gazette No. 15, issued on March 7, 2018, p3.

2. Executive Decree No 98-261 of August 29, 1998 laying down the forms and modalities of the procedures in the advisory field before the Council of State, Algerian Official Gazette No. 64 of May 30, 1998, p05.

3. Mustapha Ben DJelloul, Advisory Function of the Council of State in Algeria, Magister in Law, Faculty of Law and Administrative Sciences, University of Algiers, 2000-2001, p118.

4. Georges Maleville, competence of the Council of State, Non-contentious attributions, juris binder, paris, 1993, p01.

5. Mansour Mohamed Ahmed, Role of the State Council in the Legislative Field, Dar al-Ennahda, Cairo, Egypt, 2007, p71.

6. Jazia Sach, System of the Council of State in the Algerian Judiciary, PhD thesis in Law, Faculty of Law, University of Algeria, 2007-2008, p408.

7. RIVERO Jean, Administrative Law, Dalloz, 8th edition, paris, 1977, p194.

8. BELLOUBET- FRIER Nicole, Advisor to the State, Revue Pouvoir, N123, 2007/4, le Seuil, paris, p36.

9. Yasser Syed Hussein Sayed, Lawfulness of Laws and Legislative Decisions Not Presented to the State Council, Law Journal, Cairo University, Egypt, vol. I, No. 1, 2017, p 221.
10. Said El Sayed Ali, the Council of state and its role in drafting legislation, Dar El Kitab El Hadith, Algeria, 2009, p93.
11. Ibid, p 95.
12. Yasser Syed Hussein Syed, op. cit., p 221.
13. Said El Sayed Ali, op. cit, p 99.
14. Yasser Syed Hussein Syed, op. cit., p 227.
15. Constitution of 1996, promulgated by Presidential Decree No. 96-438 of December 7, 1996, Official Gazette No. 76 of December 8, 1996, amended by Law No. 02-03 of April 10, 2002, Official Gazette No. 25 of April 14, 2002, amended by Law No. 08-19 of November 15, 2008, Official Gazette No. 63 of November 16, 2008, amended by Law No. 16-01 of March 6, 2016, Official Gazette No. 14 of March 7, 2016, amended by Decree Presidential No. 20-251 of September 15, 2020, Official Gazette No. 54 of September 16, 2020, p 06.
16. Omar boujadi, jurisdiction of the administrative judiciary in Algeria, PhD thesis in law, faculty of Law, University of Tizi Ouzou, July 13, 2011, p.390.
17. Law No. 16-01 of March 6, 2016, Official Gazette No. 14 of March 7, 2016, amended by Decree Presidential No. 20-251 of September 15, 2020, Official Gazette No. 54 of September 16, 2020.
18. Organic Law No. 11-13, of July 26, 2011, amending and supplementing Organic Law No. 98-01, relating to the Council of State, Official Gazette No. 43 issued on August 03, 2011, p08.
19. Executive Decree No 98-261 , op. cit, p05.
20. The Rules of Procedure of the State Council, ratified by the Office of the State Council on 19 September 2019, Official Gazette No. 66, issued on 27 October 2019,p04.
21. Ahmed Hakem, The Role of the State Council in the Legislative Process, MA in In-Depth Administrative Law, Faculty of Law and Political Science, University of Tlemcen, 2015-2016, p 94.
22. Nawal Mazouzi, The advisory function of the Algerian Council of State between the legal framework and the hoped, Journal of Legal Studies, Faculty of Law and Political Science, University of Saida, Volume 6, Issue 2, December 2019, p 336.
23. Mohamed Suleiman El-Tamawi, The Brief in the Administrative Judiciary, Dar Al-Fikr Al-Arabi, Egypt, 1971, p 68.
24. Mahmoud Hilmi, Administrative Judiciary, 2nd Edition, Arab Thought House, Egypt, 1977, p 23.
25. Majid Ragheb El Helou, Administrative Judiciary, Alexandria University, Egypt, 1985, p 86.
26. Yasser Syed Hussein Syed, op. cit., p194.
27. René Chapus, Administrative Litigation Law, 5th edition, Montchrestin Lextenso edition, 2009, p53.
28. Souad Cherkaoui, Administrative Judiciary, Arab Renaissance House, Egypt, 1984, p 138.

29. Mustafa Abu Zeid Fahmy, Administrative Judiciary and State Council, first edition, Dar Al Maaref, Egypt, 1959, p 323.
30. Mohamed Abdellatif Abul Maati, Administrative Judiciary Law, Arab Renaissance House, Egypt, 2001, p 152.
31. Judgement of the Egyptian Administrative Court, dated 18 April 1950, case No. 99 of the Second Judicial Year, against the Minister of Commerce's decision No. 447 of 1947.
32. Mohamed Asaad, "What if laws and legislation were passed without being brought before the Council of State?," Egyptian newspaper Al-Youm Al-Sabea, Egyptian Press, Publishing and Advertising Company, issue of 17 July 2017, published on the following website: <https://2u.pw/XUgruf>, Date of visit: 25-02-2023, at 20:00.
33. Ibid .