The Use of Integrative and Non-Integrative Citations by EFL Graduates at the Algerian University

-The Case of Master's Students-

Bougherza Rédha*

Mohammed Seddik Benyahia University, Jijel, (Algeria)

rida.bougherza@univ-jijel.dz

AziebSamia

Mohammed Seddik Benyahia University, Jijel, (Algeria)

aziebsamia@yahoo.com

Abstract ;

The present study investigates the use of citations by Algerian EFL graduatesat Mohammed Seddik Benyahia University, Jijel/Algeria. To this end, ''the introduction'', ''the literature review'', ''the methodology'' and ''the discussion's'' sections of 8 Master EFL dissertations were analyzed. Therefore, by adopting Swales' (1990) categorization of citations, the employed citation patterns were analyzed and categorized into two main types namely: 'integral and non-integral'. The former was in turn divided into two sub-categories viz: 'integral-verb' and 'integral-naming'. The analysis of the data at the researchers' disposal revealed that the respondents used more non-integral citations than integral ones. Moreover, integral-verb citations were used more frequently than integral-naming. Hence, the researchers concluded that Algerian EFL graduates lack some writing and research skills that are prerequisite to use all citations types effectively. These findings will help emerging non-native writers of English to be aware of the proper way of using citation practices to write more effectively and persuasively. Also, an important implication of this study is to have a training course on research methodology to enhance the students' skills in the use of integral and non-integral citations in academic writing.

---

* Corresponding author

1. *Introduction*

Academic writing is customarily defined as producing academic essays or compositions that satisfy the necessity of a school or college in the target language (Tarnopolsky & Kozhushko, 2007). As a matter of fact, citing other works poses difficulties for novice writers, especially the non-native English speaking students in their first experience with academic writing (Nguyen, 2016). Clearly, one thing that is prohibited in Academia is, knowingly or unknowingly, committing plagiarism, or presenting other people's work as if it was your own. Therefore, documenting your research and acknowledging the ideas of others is indispensable. Such acknowledgement of the original sources is usually referred to as *'referencing', 'documentation', or 'citations'* (Neville, 2007).

Following this line of thought, it is worth noting that referencing is essential in the sense that it gives credit where credit is due, adds authority to a statement and shows that a writer is not just giving his/her views but also including those of other writers. It also illustrates a point or offers support for an argument that a given writer wants to make, and enables readers of a work to find the source material (Damarell *et al.*, 2005).

Hence, one of the main hallmarks of academic research papers is that they all give an overview of the existing knowledge about a given topic in order to provide supporting evidence for one's viewpoints (Lamptey &Atta-Obeng, 2012, p.70). That is, research is "greatly strengthened by placing your new information in the context of what is already known about the issue. Researchers call this process 'doing a literature search', 'survey', or 'doing a literature review' or 'study'"(Laws et al. 2003, as cited in Blaxter, Hughes, & Tight, 2006, p.122). In order to integrate all of these in your own research work, quoting ("You can cite the exact phrase or sentence used by putting it in quotations marks"); paraphrasing (using the ideas of another in your own words); and summarizing (using the main points of another) are unavoidable (Wallwork, 2011, pp.154-156).

It seems paramount to restate that when quoting, paraphrasing or summarizing, the researcher is required to cite the original source so as to avoid plagiarism. The latter is a serious offence in the academic community and it means in its simplest terms "taking credit for work that others have done" (Wallwork, 2011, p.151). As a matter of fact, plagiarism is one of the most common faults among researchers in general and students in particular. This line of reasoning is supported by the following quotation:

> Plagiarism is unacceptable under any circumstances but, despite this universal
> disapproval, it is one of the more common faults with student papers. In some cases, it is a case of downright dishonesty brought upon by laziness, but more often it is lack of experience as how to properly use material taken from another source. … Plagiarism in professional

work may result in dismissal from an academic position, being barred from publishing in a particular journal or from receiving funds from a particular granting agency, or even a lawsuit and criminal prosecution.

Dr. Ronald K. Gratz, Associate Professor in the Department of Biological Sciences, Michigan Technological University (USA), author of "Using Another's Words and Ideas"

In a nutshell, references need to be cited where documents, be them books, articles websites…etc, are used in a work. Intriguingly, accuracy and consistency are essential to enable readers to identify and locate the materials referred to (Flinders University, 2002).

At this juncture, it is worth stating that citations are of two main types namely integrative and non-integrative, a distinction which was introduced by Swales (1990). Such a division was based on the syntactic position of the name of the cited author. Therefore, integrative citations are those that play an explicit grammatical role within a sentence. As their name suggests, integral citations integrate the name of the cited author within the paragraph. It is integrated, as Swales (1990) points out, by using an *integral-verb* or by using a *noun phrase*. An example of integral verb citations is (Manan (2015) conducted a study which aimed at

analyzing the integral citations in Master's degree thesis at the University of Kebangsaan Malaysia). It is considered integral because it is integrated within this paragraph by using the integral-verb « conducted».

The other type of integral citation is integrating the name of the author by using a noun-phrase. This type is commonly referred to as *integral-naming* as described by Mansourizadeh and Ahmad (2011). An example of this type is the citation used in the previous sentence in which the names of the authors *Mansourizadeh and Ahmad* are integrated into this paragraph by occupying the position of a noun phrase (Rababah & Al-Marshadi, 2013). In non-integral citations, however, the name of the author is not integrated within the paragraph. Rather, it is introduced by mentioning the name between brackets without using any integral verbs or occupying a noun phrase position as shown in the aforementioned citation of (Rababah and Al-Marshadi, 2013).

Accordingly, the present study addresses the following research questions:

- ✓ What are Algerian EFL graduates' citation practices within the different dissertations' sections under scrutiny: Introduction, Literature Review, Methodology and Discussion?

- ✓ Do Algerian EFL writers possess the writing and research skills needed to use all citation types effectively ?

2. *LiteratureReview*

Citation practices among different postgraduate writers have been an attention-grabbing destination for many researchers. Yet, scant attention has been given to Algerian EFL graduates.

Firstly, Lamptey and Atta-Obeng (2012) brought to the fore their experience while working on the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology (KNUST). They investigated the challenges postgraduate students encounter in citing references in their academic work. In doing so, they employed a Questionnaire and an Interview. The study found out that KNUST postgraduate students have problems in mastering reference style formats because of the variations in citation. They tend to rely on books, lecturers or librarians for assistance in ensuring the accuracy of citations they use in their work. They were also unable to identify the citation format they used; they could not cite references for books and journal articles with confidence.

Another study was conducted by Rabab'ah and Al-Marshadi (2013) in which citation practices among native and nonnative English writers were investigated. Hence, 5 Master EFL dissertations written by Arab EFL learners were compared to 5 Master EFL theses written by native speakers of English. Adopting Swales' (1990) categorization, the employed citation patterns were analyzed and categorized into two types: integral and non-integral. The study revealed that the nonnative English writers used more integral-verb and non-integral citations than the native English writers.

However, it was found that the native English writers used the noun-phrase citation type more frequently than did the nonnative writers. The findings conclude that Arab EFL learners lack the writing and research skills needed to use all citations types effectively.

In a similar vein, Manan (2015) conducted a study which aimed at analyzing the integral citations in Master's degree thesis at the University of Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM). Therefore, six theses were selected based on purposive sampling. Data analysis was conducted using Thompson & Tribble's (2001) framework for integral citations. For integral citation, analysis revealed that verb controlling has the highest occurrences (n=198), followed by naming (n=48) and non- citation (n=2). There were also two new categories discovered by the researcher which are double citation; a sentence that refers to primary and secondary sources of citation; and combination category; the integral and non- integral citations which are combined in a sentence. The implication of this study is to have a training course on Research Methodology to enhance the students' skills on the important elements in doing research, particularly the use of integral citation in academic writing.

Nguyen (2016) studied in-text citations in 24 literature review chapters of TESOL M.A. theses written by Vietnamese students. The researcher employed Thompson and Tribble's (2001) framework for citation types and functions, and discourse-based interviews with the actual thesis writers and their thesis supervisors. The study confirmed the claim that non-native novice writers cannot fully

learncrucial citation practices from mere reading of the guidelines. Besides these writers' preference for integral citations and a very limited number of citation functions used in theirLR chapters, the researcher also identified the presence of several secondary citations, the students' "invented" ways of citing previous researchers, grammatical mistakes and the absence of further discussions of the cited works. Furthermore, these findings indicate a need for an increased amount of formal instruction in academic writing courses which aims at equipping novice writers with the means to successfully acknowledge the sources and at raising their awareness about the various functions and rhetorical effects of the students' citations in their academic writing.

In a more recent study, Jomaa and Bidin (2017) explored the difficulties in citing and integrating information from academic sources into the literature review chapter of PhD proposals. Their study involved conducting individual discourse-based interviews with six male Arab doctoral students who were selected purposefully from the Information Technology department of a Malaysian public university. The participants' literature review chapters were employed in a stimulated recall to retrieve their inner perceptions when writing their PhD proposals. Hand analysis, mind mapping, and visual mapping were used in the analysis of the data. Multiple codes were initially obtained and further reduced to form four major themes and several sub-themes. The findings revealed that challenges in citation included addressing the credibility of information in published

sources, adopting a stance toward the citations, insufficient knowledge about using citations, and second language difficulties.

Reviewing previous studies about citing references in academic writing has disclosed the fact that such a practice remains a stumbling block for novice writers in general and non-native ones in particular. Apparently, Algerian EFL graduates at Mohammed Seddik Benyahia University, Jijel/Algeria are no exception.

3. *Research Methodology*

Eight MA EFL dissertations which were written at Mohammed Seddik Ben Yahia University were used as the corpus for analysis in the current study. The researchers analyzed the citation practices within the different sections of those dissertations including the Introduction, the Literature Review, the Methodology and the Discussion. The Sample dissertations are sketched in the Appendix.

The dissertations under scrutiny were analyzed according to Swales' (1990) categorization of citation types which encompasses: integral and non-integral citations. Integral citations were subdivided into 'integral-verb' citations and 'integral-naming' citations. Intriguingly, the theses were analyzed in terms of the citation type used and the frequency of occurrence of each type in the above-mentioned thesis sections. For the purpose of reference when presenting the findings, the Algerian EFL graduates' dissertations were coded as Sample 1, Sample 2, Sample 3, Sample 4, Sample 5, Sample 6, Sample 7, and Sample 8.

4. Results and Discussion

This section is divided into four sub-sections depending on the dissertations' section which is analyzed in terms of using integral and non-integral citations by Algerian EFL graduates viz:1) Integrative and Non-IntegrativeCitations in the Introduction, 2) Integrative and Non-IntegrativeCitations in the Literature Review, 3) Integrative and Non-IntegrativeCitations in the Methodology, and 4) Integrative and Non-IntegrativeCitations in the Discussion.

4.1. Integrative and Non-Integrative Citations in the Introduction

When writing the general introduction of their dissertations, Algerian EFL graduates used a total of 56 citations. This is plainly displayed in Table 1 below:

Table 1. Citation Types in the Introduction

Sample	Integral Citations		Non-integral Citations	Total	
	Integral - Verb	**Integral-Naming**		**f**	**%**
Sample 1	0	0	0	**0**	/
Sample 2	2	1	2	**5**	**9.8**
Sample 3	2	0	1	**3**	**5.88**
Sample 4	4	1	2	**7**	**13.72**
Sample 5	6	3	4	**13**	**25.49**
Sample 6	4	0	2	**6**	**11.76**
Sample 7	4	1	1	**6**	**11.76**
Sample 8	7	2	2	**11**	**21.56**
TOTAL	**29**	**8**	**14**	**51**	**100**

Source: The table was designed by the researchers.

Undeniably, the introductions in this study included (37) integral citations and (14) non-integral ones. That is, they used more integral citations than non-integral ones. Examples of the former and the latter include:

1) Brown (2007) said that second language learning is a process that is clearly not unlike first language learning in its trial and errors nature **(Integral).**

2) The results indicated that the transfer of grammatical structures and rules from mother tongue (L1) explained many of the learners' errors (Wood, 2017, pp. 5-6). **(non-integral).**

It is obvious that in the first example, the citation is integral because it plays an explicit grammatical role within the sentence. As the name suggests, integral citations integrate the name of the cited author within the paragraph. Importantly, it is integrated by using the integral-verb 'said'. In the second example, however, the citation (Wood, 2017, pp. 5-6) is outside the sentence, and it is placed within brackets, and it plays no explicit grammatical role in the sentence.

It is also noticed that Algerian EFL writers used more integral-verb citations (29) than integral-naming ones (8). In addition, table 1 also shows that types of citation vary among individual theses. For example, Sample 5 included the highest number of citations (15), while Sample 1 did not include any citation type under investigation.

4.2. Integrative and Non-Integrative Citations in the Literature Review

One of the most significant findings of the present study is that the literature review section, when compared to other theses sections under investigation, yielded the highest number of citations of the different types. This might be attributed to the fact that most of the previous studies

usually fall in this section. In the English department at Mohammed Seddik Ben Yahia University, the Literature Review is divided into two sections whereby each one discusses one of the study's variables. Consider Table 2:

Table 2. Citation Types in Literature Review

Sample	Integral Citations		Non-integral Citations	Total	
	Integral Verb	Noun Phrase		f	%
Sample 1	30	12	49	91	13.87
Sample 2	20	8	57	85	12.95
Sample 3	30	11	44	85	12.95
Sample 4	33	9	25	67	10.21
Sample 5	19	4	45	68	10.36
Sample 6	42	12	53	107	16.31
Sample 7	20	36	41	97	14.78
Sample 8	13	7	36	56	8.53
TOTAL	207	99	350	656	100

Source: The table was designed by the researchers.

Clearly, the respondents used a total of 656 citations in the literature review including (306) integral citations and (350) non-integral citations with Sample 6 including the highest number of citations (16,31%) and Sample 8 recording the lowest number (8.53%). Examples of these include the following:

1) According to Johnstone (2002), it is conceivable to locate a significant clarification about the terms 'Young and Old' learners **(Integrative).**

2) Another example of wild children is that of Victor who was found in the wild at the age of 11 to 12 (Steinberg & Sciarini, 2006, p.93) **(Non-integrative).**

The above table also shows that the writers used more integral-verb (207) citations like (Gleitman and Newport (1995) speculated that the CP may have a middle, "marginal" time in which partial development is possible) than noun-phrase citations (99) like Johnstone's citation above.

4.3. *Integrative and Non-Integrative Citations in the Methodology*

As shown in Table 3 below, the writers used a total of 70 citations in the methodology section including 35 integral citations and 35 non-integral ones respectively:

1) Nunan (1992) considered the experimental design an effective approach applied in academic and scientific research which aims at exploring the strength of the relationship between the variables.

2) The validity of the FLCAS structure was determined using Cronbach's alpha reliability estimates and principal component factor analysis (Matsuda & Gobel, 2004, p. 26).

Moreover, the respondents used more integral verbs (21) than noun phrase citations (14). As far as the individual theses are concerned, it was noticed that Sample 1 recorded the least number of citations (4.28%) while Sample 3 recorded the highest number of citations (25.71%).

Table 3. Citation Types in the Methodology

Sample	Integral Citations		Non-integral Citations	Total	
	Integral Verb	**Integral-Naming**		**f**	**%**
Sample 1	3	0	0	3	4.28
Sample 2	2	2	3	7	10
Sample 3	6	4	8	18	25.71
Sample 4	2	3	4	9	12.85
Sample 5	1	1	6	8	11.42
Sample 6	4	2	9	15	21.42
Sample 7	2	1	2	5	7.14
Sample 8	1	1	3	5	7.14
TOTAL	21	14	35	70	100

Source: The table was designed by the researchers.

4.4. *Integrative and Non-Integrative Citations in the Discussion*

Table 4 below shows that the discussion's section recorded the least number of citations when compared to other sections (44). Importantly, more non-integral citations (25) were recorded than integral ones (19). Also, the number of integral-naming citations (15) was greater than that of integral-verb citations (4). Consider the following examples:

1) Muhsin (2016) <u>claimed</u> that misformation errors are the most frequent errors made by their students. **(Integral-verb).**
2) This finding is consistent with those found in the work of Grimshaw and Cardoso (2019) **(Integral-Naming).**
3) This goes in line with, Scoon (1971) who hypothesized that the desire to integrate with the foreign culture correlates positively with one's

success in language learning (Tamimi,2017 p.30). **(Non-Integral).**

Table 4. Citation Types in the Discussion

Sample	Integral Citations		Non-integral Citations	Total	
	Integral Verb	**Noun Phrase**		**f**	**%**
Sample 1	0	0	2	2	4.54
Sample 2	1	3	1	5	11.36
Sample 3	0	1	2	3	6.81
Sample 4	0	1	5	6	13.63
Sample 5	0	2	2	4	9.09
Sample 6	1	5	3	9	20.45
Sample 7	0	1	6	7	15.9
Sample 8	2	2	4	8	18.18
TOTAL	4	15	25	44	100

Source: The table was designed by the researchers.

As far as the individual dissertations are concerned, it is apparent that there are differences in citation types and percentages. In this regard, Samples 6 and 8 recorded the highest precentage, 20.45% and 18.18%, respectively. On the other hand, Samples 1, and 3 recorded the lowest citations, (4.54, and 6.81), respectively.

4.5. *Putting it All Together*

At this juncture, it paramount to reconsider the main results of the current study. Accordingly, Table 5 below shows that Algerian EFL graduates used a total of 826 citations in the four sections under investigation. An unsurprising finding is that the literature review recorded most of the citations in the 8 dissertations under scrutiny (656). This could be attributed to the fact that the bulk of previous research cited in any MA or PhD theses should appear in this section. This finding is in symbiosis with the results of some previous studies (Matinovic-Zic, 2004 ; Rababah &

Al-Marshadi, 2013 ; Nguyen, 2016). It is also noticed that the least number of citations was recorded in the discussion's section (44). The most important finding in this study is that the respondents used more non-integral citations (429) than integral ones (397). Interestingly, Table 5 below summarizes the issues that were discussed in the previous sections:

Table 5. Total Citations in Algerian EFL Graduates' Dissertations

Thesis Section	Integral		Non-integral	Total	
	Integral Verb	Noun Phrase		f	%
Introduction	29	8	19	56	6.77
Literature Review	207	99	350	656	79.41
Methodology	21	14	35	70	8.47
Discussion	15	4	25	44	5.32
Total	272	125	429	826	100

Source: The table was designed by the researchers.

One of the most prominent findings of the present research is that Algerian EFL graduates used more non-integral citations (429) than integral ones (397) (integral-verb citations and integral-naming). This might be attributed to the difficulty level of this kind of citation (the integral one) among nonnative writers in general and Algerian EFL ones in particular. It is undeniable that integral citations require proficient restructuring in order to cite a source correctly. Probably, due to their lack of communicative competencies, and the fact that they do not want to exert an effort and insert their input, Algerian EFL graduates failed in using citations correctly and persuasively. This line of thought is in conformity with the findings of other studies like (Rababah & Al-Marshadi,

2013 ; Manan, 2015; Nguyen, 2016). Moreover, expert writers usually use sophisticated processes to show their own findings in relations to earlier contributions and seem to master citation practices, while novice writers lack these advanced skills (Mansourizadeh & Ahmad, 2011). Clearly, Algerian EFL graduates are no exception in this regard.

5. Conclusion and Recommendations

This study examined the use of integrative and non-integrative citations by Algerian EFL graduates. The obtained results showed that Algerian EFL writers, like any other novice writers cannot fully learn crucial citation practices from their mere reading of the instructions or guidelines provided. Rather, more practice and guidance are required. Therefore, since the effective and appropriate use of citations necessitates advanced research and academic writing skills, in light of the findings of the present research, emerging writers, especially Algerian EFL graduates, should be taught how to use citation efficiently, and strategically to be more persuasive. Finally, the researchers recommend that English for Academic Purposes (EAP) writing textbooks and courses should include how such writers may cite different resources appropriately, focusing on different citation types and advanced, sophisticated writing skills. Exercises on such practices and skills should be provided for novice, nonnative English writers and graduate students to enable them to write well-formed texts. Also, an important implication of this study is to have a training course on Research Methodology to enhance the students' skills

in the use of integral and non-integral citations in academic writing.

6. *Bibliography List* :

1. Blaxter, L., Hughes, C., & Tight, M. (2006). *How to research.* New York : Open University Press.

2. Damarell, R., Badcock, J. and Miller, R. (2005). *Author-date (Harvard) referencing guide,* 3rd ed. Adelaide: Flinders University, School of Nursing and Midwifery.

3. Flinders University (2002). *Style manuals for authors, editors and primaries*, 6th ed. Canberra: Smooks and Company.

4. Jomaa, N.J., & Bidin, S.J. (2017). Perspective of EFL doctoral students on challenges of citations in academic writing. *Malaysian Journal of Learning and Instruction (MJLI),* 14 (2).

5. Lamptey, R., and Atta-Obeng, H. (2012). Challenges with reference citations among postgraduate students at the Kwame Nkrumah University of science and technology, Kumasi, Ghana. *Journal of Science and Technology*, Vol. 32, No. 3.

6. Manan, N. (2015). The use of integral citations in master's degree theses. International *Journal of Education and Research*, 3 (7).

7. Mansourizadeh, K., & Ahmad, U. K. (2011). Citation practices among non-native expert and novice scientific writers. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes, 10*(3), 152-161.

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jeap.2011.03.004.

8. Martinovic-Zic, A. (2004). *Discourse across languages and cultures.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

9. Neville, C. (2007). *TheComplete guide to referencing and avoiding plagiarism.* Available at http://books.google.com.gh/ .

10. Nguyen, T. (2016). Citations in literature review chapters of TESOL master's theses by Vietnamese postgraduates, *Online Journal of Language Studies*, 16 (2).

11. Rabab'ah, G., & Al-Marshadi, A. (2013). Integrative vs. non integrative citations among native and non-native English writers. *International Education Studies,* 6(7).

12. Swales, J. M. (1990). *Genre analysis: English in academic and research setting*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

13. Tarnopolsky, O., & Kozhushko, S. (2007). *Teaching academic writing in English to tertiary students in Ukraine*. International Online Conference on Second and Foreign Language Teaching and Research. *Retrieved August 16, 2008 from*http://www.readingmatrix.com/conference/pp/proceedings2007/tarnopolsky

14. Wallwork, A. (2011). *English for writing research papers*. New York : Springer